

MINUTES OF THE STUDY SESSION AND REGULAR MEETING OF THE TOWN COUNCIL OF THE TOWN OF CHINO VALLEY

**TUESDAY, NOVEMBER 8, 2022
6:00 P.M.**

**CHINO VALLEY COUNCIL CHAMBERS
202 N. STATE ROUTE 89, CHINO VALLEY, AZ**

Present: Mayor Jack Miller; Vice-Mayor Annie Perkins; Councilmember Tom Armstrong; Councilmember Eric Granillo; Councilmember Cloyce Kelly; Councilmember John McCafferty; Councilmember Lon Turner

Staff Present: Town Manager Cindy Blackmore; Assistant to the Town Manager Terri Denemy; Town Attorney Andrew McGuire; Development Services Director Laurie Lineberry; Administrative Services Director Joe Duffy; Human Resources Director Laura Kyriakakis; Police Chief Chuck Wynn; Civilian Operations Supervisor Marrilee Easton; Senior Planner Will Dingee; Public Works Director/Town Engineer Frank Marbury; Officer Andrea Mixon; Officer Jon Szymanski; Public Information Officer Tricia Lewis; Community Services Director Cyndi Thomas; Audio Visual Technician Lawrence Digges; Deputy Town Clerk Sara Burchill; Town Clerk Erin N. Deskins

**STUDY SESSION
TUESDAY, NOVEMBER 8, 2022
5:30 P.M.**

**Council Chambers
202 N. State Route 89
Chino Valley, Arizona**

1) CALL TO ORDER; ROLL CALL

Mayor Miller called the meeting to order at 5:30 p.m.

2) Discussion regarding submitting a ballot item to the voters whether to change the term of Mayor from 2-year to 4-year. (Erin N. Deskins, Town Clerk)

Town Clerk, Erin Deskins, presented the following:

- Staff and the Mayor wanted to discuss changing the term of Mayor from two to four years.
- The Town had been using the two-year term since 1984 through Ordinance No. 48. Town Code 30.001(b) stated that the term of office for the Mayor was two years.
- To amend the term, the item would need to go before qualified voters in the Town.
- The Town would already be holding a special election in November 2023 for the General Plan update and the sale of Old Home Manor land. This item could be added to that

election.

Council and staff discussed the following;

- The Mayor brought up the issue because the learning curve for the office took nearly two years and then the term was up. He thought four years would be better, so that the person would be better able to complete what they had started.
- The term would not begin until after the next election in 2024.
- Members discussed that the longer term was important so that the position had more time to work on projects and get the job done properly.
- Council terms were four years. It would be up to the people to decide if the Mayor should also be there for four years.
- The Town's previous Mayor had thought a four-year term would be good for the position.
- Members agreed that the two-year term was too short, and it should be put on the ballot.

3) Presentation and discussion on housing factors impacting recruitment and retention and how those items might be addressed through a town sponsored workforce housing initiative. (Laura Kyriakakis, Human Resource Director / Charles Wynn, Chief of Police)

Human Resources Director, Laura Kyriakakis, presented the following:

- There had been challenges in recruiting staff in recent years and in some cases retaining staff, which was attributed to three primary reasons: pay, labor force, and housing.
- The 2020 US census gave an overview of the median household income for the area of Town. The Town was the 6th lowest for the areas listed. The average weekly US wage was \$1,298, Maricopa County was \$1,178, Yavapai County was \$1,025, and the Town's average weekly wage was \$948. To address the issue, staff were going through a compensation and classification study to ensure they matched the region in pay. Once wages were matched to the area, pay could be taken off the table, and it was everything else that the employer did that made people want to stay.
- The population of Town was 13,020, with 56% of the population age range between 18 and 64 years old, but not all those people were in the workforce. Only 41% of the tri-city population made up the workforce. The US total workforce was 62% of the total population. The US median age was 38.3, the Arizona median age was 37.9, and the tri-city median age was 51.7. Retirees made up the largest demographic in the region, leaving the Town a smaller candidate pool. Because of this, they had to recruit externally and internally to improve the candidate pool.
- Available housing for the workforce had become a growing concern in the region, which indirectly affected the Town's ability to recruit and keep staff. The average home prices in the area were high. The maximum buying power for someone making \$65,500 was a maximum of \$275,000 through an FHA loan with 3.5% down. The average median yearly wage in Town was \$46,000. Staff shared the available housing inventory in Town, broken down for houses under \$300,000 and houses between \$300,000 and \$500,000. The outlining housing stock was also reviewed. The prices of homes were not coming down, even though the availability was going up. Interest rates were also high. With every percent increase in the interest rate, a buyer's purchase power was decreased by 10%.
- Staff was addressing the pay issue, and hiring externally, but they needed to address the housing issue.
- It was expensive to have a high turnover. The government turnover average for 2021 was 18%, the City of Prescott had a 16% turnover rate, the Town's turnover rate had been 5.7% last fiscal year, but had increased by July 1, 2022, to 10.9%. All the people that had

left were non-exempt or frontline staff. In exit interviews, 66% of those leaving mentioned better pay or career opportunities as all or part of their decision to resign.

- Their highest turnovers were in the police department, public works-facilities, parks, and roads department, administration, animal control, development services, courts, and utilities.
- Turnover costs included expenses such as recruitment, orientation, training, lost knowledge, burnout, depleted morale, and loss of productivity. As an example, for a benefited employee making \$45,000 annually that left, it took 90 days to replace the position. The cost to replace the individual could be up to \$24,000. For the total number of people lost since July 1, it was approximately \$288,000. The turnover cost in the police department was substantially higher.
- It was different to replace officers because of State requirements for training and certification. They were currently putting two people in the academy that started January 9th. The advertisement for the positions started in August. The academy was 21 weeks long, and then they had a 16-week field training and other training. They would not be solo on the job until October 2023. The costs would be reduced if they could hire a lateral officer instead of a new officer, but the pool of people was running low in the area. They were having to recruit staff out of the area, but they did not have affordable housing.
- Staff had been researching the issue of transitional housing for new hires from outside the Town's area. If they could advertise that the housing was available, it would take away one of the biggest hiring barriers.
- Staff wanted to discuss options and costs with the Council.

Council and staff discussed the following;

- The housing would be something the Town owned as temporary employee, transitional housing. It would be rented to them at market rate.
- Other cities and towns were already providing this type of housing. There were several different models and different ways of handling the housing.
- Staff was waiting for Council to give the go ahead to further research the issue before getting detailed information.
- Council discussed the issue that every service industry had the same issues.
- The Yavapai College was exploring the 3D housing option, but it was not moving as fast as they anticipated. It could be something the Town piggybacked on.
- There was concern about where new employees would move to if they could not afford a local house. Multi-family housing was needed within the Town.
- Council was open to staff doing further research.
- The school district was looking at places where housing could be built and available for future teachers.

4) **ADJOURNMENT**

Mayor Miller adjourned the meeting at 5:53 p.m.

**REGULAR MEETING
TUESDAY, NOVEMBER 8, 2022
6:00 P.M.**

**Council Chambers
202 N. State Route 89
Chino Valley, Arizona**

A majority of the Councilmembers may attend a private invocation in the Council Conference Room immediately prior to the Council meeting. No Town business will be discussed.

AGENDA

1) CALL TO ORDER, PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE; ROLL CALL

Mayor Miller called the meeting to order at 6:01 p.m. and led the Pledge of Allegiance.

All members of Council and Staff previously mentioned were present for the duration of the Regular Meeting.

2) INTRODUCTIONS, PRESENTATIONS, AND PROCLAMATIONS

- a)** Graduation presentation for the 2022 Citizens Academy. (Terri Denemy, Assistant to the Town Manager)

Terri Denemy presented the following:

- The six-week Citizens Academy was completed, and 21 people had attended to learn more about Town government operations.
- Two Councilmember elects also participated in the Academy.
- Because the group was so engaged, they extended the sessions from five to six. Through the six academy sessions, each department had the opportunity to make a presentation.
- The group was able to do facility tours.
- The group was officially graduating from the citizens academy and received pins and certificates.
- Cathy Middlested – attended the Academy. She thanked everyone for their efforts, presentations, and tours during the Academy. The group had learned more than expected. She thought the program should be eight weeks, because of all the information that was presented. She was pleased with how the Town functioned and the camaraderie within the Town.

- b)** Introduction and presentation of Town of Chino Valley new employee hires. (Laura Kyriakakis, Human Resources Director)

Human Resources Director Laura Kyriakakis presented the following:

An introduction and/or list of seven new employees in the Police, Public Works, and Development Services departments was reviewed.

3) CALL TO THE PUBLIC- Individuals requesting to speak, please complete a Speaker Comment Card and return to the Clerk.

Call to the Public is an opportunity for the public to address the Council on any issue within the jurisdiction of the Council that is not on the agenda. Public comment is encouraged. Individuals are limited to speak for three (3) minutes. The total time for Call to the Public may be up to 30

minutes per meeting. Council action taken as a result of public comment will be limited to directing staff to study the matter, scheduling the matter for further consideration and decision at a later date, or responding to criticism.

- Cathy Middlested – A citizen had posted on the NextDoor website to come to the meeting to ask the Council to remove Ordinance No. 4.9.1, which stated that no travel trailer, motorhome, recreational vehicle, or boat stored on residentially zoned parcels shall be made suitable for onsite occupancy unless permitted in the specific zoning regulation. Evidence of onsite residency consisted of three of the five or six conditions that were listed in the ordinance. She was not for removal of the ordinance. They had regulations for a reason, including nice neighborhoods. She did not think recreational vehicles, travel trailers, and motorhomes were for full-time residency.
- Mark Bonaquista – He wanted the Council to decide on what they were going to do with travel trailers on properties. Development Services and Code Enforcement were issuing citations to some people, but not to others. He had filed several things, including one filed July 15, 2020, regarding a person with five travel trailers on their property, which was also a million-dollar business property. There were live-in residents that were illegal aliens that were there for a place to live and work. The paperwork that was submitted was marked "no violation," which he did not understand, since there were five [RVs] on the property. He had approximately 150 other code violations sent into the Development Services Department, and they all had "no violation" marked on the form. He thought there was a derelict of duty, and they were not doing their job in code enforcement, or there was discrimination. He thought Council needed to investigate and figure out what they were going to do. There were many people who did not have a place to live, and the problem needed to be addressed. He wanted to know why there were no violations in regard to it.
- Luke Cilano – He had spoken last week at the meeting, and it came to his attention that he owed an apology. Anyone that worked with children knew that you don't act out when the children act out. He owed the Council an apology because he did not know who or what they were. The Council made it clear who and what they were by getting up and walking out of the room, which was what children do when they don't like what was being said. He owed them an apology because he did not treat them properly. He owed the Town an apology because he normally did not let things get under his skin. He was also there on UDO 4.9.1. They lived in a downturned economy. He had been told comments to the Council were on deaf ears, but he thought they could move past that. When he moved to Town in 2019, the code said he could have up to six RVs on his property if zoned correctly. The zoning was changed. He thought they needed to change the code; he did not want the section removed. He thought they should be able to have RVs on a property if they were maintained and tidy. The code needed to be worded in a way that it was not used as a weapon. He found out that Vice-Mayor Perkins had made a complaint about his property, and he did not even know her. He did not know why she would complain, because he kept his stuff and property clean. They were trying to help people by lifting them up, by giving them a place to stay, and live. He was not getting rich or running slums, he was helping people, which is what a community was supposed to do.
- Vice-Mayor Perkins responded, as allowed by State law. She explained he was correct. She made the complaint after seeing multiple RVs and vans come onto his property across from the elementary school and in violation of the code. She was the one that made the complaint.

4) **CURRENT EVENT SUMMARIES AND REPORTS**

This item is for information only. The Mayor, any Councilmember, or Town Manager may present a brief summary or report of current events. If listed below, there may also be a presentation on information requested by the Mayor and Council and questions may be answered. No action will be taken.

- a) Status reports by Mayor and Council regarding current events.
 - Mayor Miller reported on an upcoming Veteran Pancake Breakfast held at the Senior Center.
 - Councilmember Perkins presented and congratulated the Chino Valley 2022 Boys State Champions. They were two-time State champions.
 - Councilmember Kelly reported that November 10th would be the US Marine's 247th birthday. The region had the largest destination of disabled and retired check-ins for the Marine Corps in the world.
- b) Status report by Town Manager Cindy Blackmore regarding Town accomplishments, and current or upcoming projects.

The Clerk's Office would be accepting applications to fulfill vacancies on the Planning and Zoning Commission from November 16th through December 15th.

5) **CONSENT AGENDA**

All those items listed below are considered to be routine and may be enacted by one motion. Any Councilmember may request to remove an item from the Consent Agenda to be considered and discussed separately.

MOVED by Vice-Mayor Annie Perkins, seconded by Councilmember Tom Armstrong to approve items a, b, and c as written.

AYE: Mayor Jack Miller, Vice-Mayor Annie Perkins, Councilmember Tom Armstrong, Councilmember Eric Granillo, Councilmember Cloyce Kelly, Councilmember John McCafferty, Councilmember Lon Turner

7 - 0 PASSED - Unanimously

- a) Consideration and possible action to approve a proposal from Willdan Financial Service to perform a Comprehensive User Fee Study. (Joe Duffy, Administrative Services Director)
- b) Consideration and possible action to approve the Town Manager Employment Agreement with Cindy Blackmore. (Laura Kyriakakis, Human Resources Director)
- c) Consideration and possible action to approve the October 11, 2022, study session and regular meeting minutes. (Erin N. Deskins, Town Clerk)

6) **ACTION ITEMS**

The Council may vote to recess the public meeting and hold an Executive Session on any item on this agenda pursuant to A.R.S. § 38-431.03(A)(3) for the purpose of discussion or consultation for legal advice with the Town Attorney. Executive sessions are not open to the public and no action may be taken in executive session.

7) **ADJOURNMENT**

MOVED by Councilmember Lon Turner, seconded by Councilmember Tom Armstrong to adjourn the meeting at 6:33 p.m.

AYE: Mayor Jack Miller, Vice-Mayor Annie Perkins, Councilmember Tom Armstrong, Councilmember Eric Granillo, Councilmember Cloyce Kelly, Councilmember John McCafferty, Councilmember Lon Turner

7 - 0 PASSED - Unanimously



Jack W. Miller, Mayor

ATTEST:



Erin N. Deskins

Erin N. Deskins, Town Clerk

CERTIFICATION:

I hereby certify that the foregoing minutes are a true and correct copy of the minutes of the Regular Meeting of the Town Council of the Town of Chino Valley, Arizona held on the 8th day of November, 2022. I further certify that the meeting was duly called and held and that a quorum was present.

Dated this 13th day of December, 2022.

Erin N. Deskins

Erin N. Deskins, Town Clerk